2012 Effie® Awards
Judging Guide

Effie Awards

Effie honors the most significant achievement in marketing communications: ideas that work.

Any and all marketing communications efforts that contribute to a brand’s success, whether full campaigns or unique efforts within a campaign, are eligible to enter and compete for an award. Retail experience, viral, buzz, digital, direct mail, PR, radio, TV, print, etc. – efforts driven by any one or any multiple combination of marketing touch points – are eligible for an Effie, as long as results are proven. To succeed entrants must detail the “why” behind the strategy and provide proof that the work achieved significant results.

Effie judges review a wide-range of cases, including efforts that span months or years and efforts that span a single day only. Cases can also be local, regional or national in scope. The key element that separates out the winners is not overall scope, size or duration of the case – it is whether the results achieved were significant in the context of the category, audience, competition, resources, idea, strategy, etc. Was it an idea that worked?

Since 1968, winning an Effie has become a global symbol of achievement. Today, Effie celebrates effectiveness worldwide with annual North America, Global, Euro and Middle East/North Africa Effie competitions and 40+ national Effie programs. For more details, visit www.effie.org.

Judging Instructions

Prior to judging, please review this document - the 2012 Judging Guide. Each entry you will review contains both the questions entrants were asked to address and their response. In some cases, entrants did not thoroughly answer individual questions or did not follow instructions. It is up to you to decide whether or not these failures to follow instructions either preclude you from making an informed decision, or give the entrants an unfair advantage. Please reflect these considerations in your scoring.

Marketing communications efforts that ran in North America – defined as the US or Canada - between 9/1/10 – 8/31/11 are eligible. Cases can have data before that time period but the bulk of the data must fall within the time period. No results after 8/31/11 are permitted for this year.

You will review one or more categories of finalists during your judging session. Discussion is a part of the judging process and will be introduced by the Room Leader at the end of each category.

Scoring: All scoring should be done confidentially, without discussion. You have the opportunity to change your scores after the discussion is over, before score sheets are collected.

Confidentiality

The information within the cases you will review is privileged information. We ask that you observe strict rules of confidentiality - please refrain from taking away notes or materials. Discussion of cases is allowed during the portion of the judging in which the Room Leader initiates discussion.

As courtesy to fellow judges, and to the time taken to present cases, please turn off all mobile devices before judging begins. No calls, texts, etc. should take place in the judging room. You must sign and date the Judge’s Confidentiality Agreement before your judging session.
**Recusing yourself from Judging a Category or Entry**

Please recuse yourself from judging a particular category* if it contains a case from the company where you work, if you have worked directly on one of the cases or if one of the cases represents direct competitive work to a brand you work on. To recuse yourself:

- Write "Recuse" across the score sheet, sign it and give to the Room Leader.
- You will be asked to leave the room during the judging of the category. An Effie Admin. will call you in at the end of that category.

* **Note:** For the specialty categories of African American, Brand Experience, Corporate Reputation, David vs. Goliath, Goodworks, Hispanic, Influencers, LGBT, Media Idea, Media Innovation, New P&S, Renaissance, Shopper Marketing, Single Impact Engagement, Single Media Company Activation, Small Budgets and Sustained Success you only need to recuse yourself from a particular case, not the category, because these categories incorporate many different products and services.

There may be reasons other than the example provided that might cause you to recuse yourself from judging a specific case. In all cases, please use your professional judgment. If you have any questions, please don’t hesitate to discuss them with the Effie Awards Room Leader.

**Mark a Case for Disqualification**

Your judge folder includes the Effie disqualification rules. If you believe an entry has violated one of these rules:

- Mark the case for potential disqualification by writing "disqualify" next to it on your score sheet and the reason why you think it should be disqualified.
- Notify the Effie Room Leader.
- **After doing the above, continue to score the case as you would a regular entry.** The Effie Judging Chair and Committee will review any cases marked for disqualification and determine whether the case will be disqualified, based on the rules.

**Scoring Procedure**

**Step 1:** You will read the case brief for the first case in a category and then review the creative material for that case. Creative material will be shown by the Effie Admins in each judging room.

**Step 2:** You will provide four scores for that case on your score sheet. If you believe a case should receive a trophy, please make that designation on the score sheet.

**Step 3:** Provide insight on the specific questions asked about each case. Effie will share this insight with entrants who request it to help them enter their effective work more effectively. All insight will be shared anonymously.

**Step 4:** At the end of each category the Room Leader will initiate a 5 minute discussion. You will have the opportunity to change your scores confidentially after the discussion is over, before score sheets are collected.

**Scale:**

Use the 1-100 scale to score the effectiveness of the case on each of the four score criteria.

1<--------------------------------------------------------------------------------->100

* **NOTE:** Cases you believe should be winners: On your score sheet you can indicate if you think a case deserves a Gold, Silver, or Bronze award.
1. **Strategic Communications Challenge + Objectives**  1-100 score

   *Entrants were asked to address:*

   - **What was the strategic communications challenge?** Provide context on the degree of difficulty of this challenge – What was going on? Provide information on the category, marketplace, company, competitive environment and/or the product or service that created your challenge and your response to it. Provide competitive context. Provide a definition of the audience you were trying to reach.

   - **What were your objectives?** What were the Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) against your objectives. State specific objectives and the tools you used to measure each objective. Provide a prior year benchmark for each KPI or context regarding why they are significant if no prior benchmark is available. Your entry may have one or all of the following objectives: A. Business, B. Behavioral, C. Perceptual/Attitudinal.

   *Note:* Your score should reflect whether complete information needed to assess the case is provided in this section and also the degree of challenge represented by the objectives.

2. **Idea**  1-100 score

   *Entrants were asked to address:*

   - What was the idea that drove your effort?
   - Share your insight & how it originated.
   - Explain how the big idea addressed the challenge.

3. **Bringing the Idea to Life**  1-100 score

   *Entrants were asked to address:*

   - **Written Form:**
     - Describe & provide rationale for the communications strategy that brought the idea to life, as borne from the insights and strategic challenge described.
     - How did the creative & media strategies work together to reach your specific audience?
     - How did you link the insight to the channel choices and how does it play out in your strategy to bring the idea to life?
   - **Video:**
     - The creative reel should showcase the integral creative that brought the idea to life. This is not a video of the written case. Creative work submitted should exemplify the rationale described in this section and must have run in the marketplace.
     - Show complete examples of work except where editing is necessary for time purposes. You do not need to feature on the video all items in the communications touchpoint checklist, only those integral to the case’s success that are mentioned in your written case. Do not include results on the video.

   Each of the above 3 criteria (Strategic Comm. Challenge + Objectives, Idea, Bringing the Idea to Life) will have equal weight (23.3%) in the final score, totaling 70% of the final score.

4. **Results**  1-100 score

   *Entrants were asked to address:*

   - **How do you know it worked?** (include KPIs). Explain with context why your results are significant.
   - Refer to your specific audience, objectives and measurement tools in 5b. Demonstrate how you met or exceeded the objectives using quantitative and behavioral metrics or other measurement tools you described. Provide pre and post measures and an understanding of the industry norm.
   - Provide research involved and the time period covered for the results provided. Proof may be indexed.
   - All data must be sourced. Sources can be advertiser data, agency research or research from third party research companies.

   The score for Results will count towards 30% of the final score.
E.G. SAMPLE JUDGE SCORE for Case #3214: 85 / 90 / 87 / 90

- AFTER JUDGING IS OVER, Effie will weight the scores as follows:
  - 23.3% - Strategic Communications Challenge + Objectives = 85 x .233 = 19.80
  - 23.3% - Idea = 90 x .233 = 20.97
  - 23.3% - Bringing the Idea to Life = 87 x .233 = 20.27
  - 30% - Results = 90 x .30 = 27

= Composite score for case #3214 = 88

Some Guidelines for Reviewing Evidence

The definition of the Strategic Communications Challenge is the glue that shapes the other elements of the case. Please insure that the Strategic Communications Challenge is clearly understood, both as described in the case and from any other knowledge you may have of the particular category. Assess the elements of the case for both suitability and ambitiousness within the framework of the Strategic Communications Challenge.

Important: How did each area relate to the stated objectives & were the objectives fully explained? Most critically, did results fulfill the stated objectives? Entrants should detail what objectives they had & why they are significant in the context of their situation. If the entrant did not have objectives upfront or they were open-objectives, they should explain this and why the results achieved are significant in the context of their situation.

Evaluate the degree to which the Results – including, but not limited to, sales and shipment data, store audits, diary panels, tracking studies and marketing communications research -- clearly demonstrate success in achieving the stated objectives. For example, if the objective is to improve brand awareness, the proof cannot be an increase in sales.

The more precise and relevant the documentation, the stronger the case. You must also decide whether the evidence presented meets accepted research standards.

Weight should be given to the following:
  - Degree of difficulty articulated in the Strategic Comm. Challenge, Objectives and Idea
  - How closely the Idea, Strategy and Results address the Challenge
  - Selection / justification of the audience relative to the Challenge
  - How inventive the Idea and Strategy is in meeting the Strategic Comm. Challenge

Entries range from small cases in regional markets to nationwide blitzes. Please take into account the environment in which each case exists.
  - A small percentage move in a highly-segmented, high volume category -- such as Automotive -- is more difficult to achieve than a large percentage change is a small, less-competitive or non-competitive category such as Real Estate or Government.
  - Likewise, a large sales increase for a product that has never advertised before might be less impressive than a smaller sales increase for a product that has no budget increase but changed its marketing communications strategy.

Guidelines for Reviewing the Creative Work

The 4-minute video, showcasing the main work that drove the results, should be judged relative to the stated creative strategy. Entrants were asked to show complete examples except where editing was necessary for time purposes and were not allowed to include results on the video, according to the Effie entry rules. Video should not be judged on production value – entrants were asked to simply showcase their integral creative materials. Please consider these key issues:
  - How well the work reflects the articulated Strategy and Idea
  - The contribution the work was expected to make to the overall marketing effort
  - How the submitted materials for each case work, individually and together

Thank you for judging the 2012 Effie Awards.